

THEN WAS *THIS* CHRISTIAN “GLAD AND LIGHTSOME”

How a young doubter found blessed assurance

As a young minister, I was very sure of my sinfulness. My seven-days-a-week confrontation with conscience provided evidence enough. Not that I announced my status from the pulpit each Sabbath. There I spoke of God's gracious forgiveness. But inside, down in the citadel of my soul, Doubt worked out each morning by pinning Assurance's shoulders to the mat. It was no contest.

In retrospect, my lack of assurance in God's forgiveness and acceptance came from misreading—or selectively reading—the Bible and the Spirit of Prophecy. Of course, the Bible does assure us that the sinner who confesses his sins can count on

God to forgive his sins and to cleanse him “from all unrighteousness” (1 John 1:9, KJV). But somehow I felt I had to be good enough to deserve that forgiveness. From Ellen White came a warning that I should never say “I am saved.”¹ I thought she meant that I could never have the assurance of divine acceptance. And a pastor without assurance is not likely to nur-

**Richard M. Davidson is President of the Adventist Theological Society. He is also J. N. Andrews Professor of Old Testament Interpretation and Chair of the Old Testament Department, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, Andrews University, Berrien Springs, Michigan.*

“The Lord did also lead me into the mystery of union with the Son of God. . . .By this also was my faith in him, as my righteousness, the more confirmed in me; for if he and I were one, then his righteousness was mine, his merit mine, his victory also mine.”

—John Bunyan in his autobiography, *Grace Abounding to the Chief of Sinners*, p. 102.

ture an assured congregation.

Today, as a professor of Old Testament in the SDA Theological Seminary, I stand before my students rejoicing that I am “accepted in the Beloved,” assured of salvation through the blood of the Lamb. I’ve learned that the essence of the new covenant promise, assured by the blood that flowed from the Saviour’s riven side, is the forgiveness of sins.² Salvation and forgiveness are at the heart of what happened at the cross. I’ve learned also that I had misunderstood Ellen White’s position on assurance of salvation.

What made the difference in my experience? Essentially, prayerful study and internalizing of the great biblical statements on forgiveness. Rather than describe my discoveries in a technical, exegetical study, I invite you to rejoice with me as we explore four facets of forgiveness—its (1) foundation, (2) appropriation, (3) jubilation, and (4) attestation. Regrettably, each facet at times has been

distorted within Christendom (and Adventism) by emphasizing one to the exclusion of others. Intrinsic in all are the inspired insights into God’s gracious assurances that made my soul, as Bunyan wrote of Christian, “glad and lightsome.”³

Let’s begin by exploring

I. The Foundation of Forgiveness

Forgiveness finds expression in three virtually synonymous biblical terms: *pardon*, *remission*, and *justification*.⁴ Closely related are *reconciliation*, *covering*, *atonement*, and *propitiation*. In an intriguing reference, Ellen White calls “pardon and justification. . . one and the same thing. . . .The sinner receives the forgiveness of his sins, because these sins are borne by his Substitute and Surety.”⁵ For the Hebrew and Greek terms that convey the concept of forgiveness, see the accompanying box.

Forgiveness finds its foundation in the blood of Christ, our substitutionary sacrifice. Paul writes: “Christ our

passover is sacrificed for us” (1 Cor. 5:7, KJV). Here we are directed to the first Passover, at the time of Israel’s deliverance from bondage in Egypt. What was the basis of their freedom? The blood of the Lamb! Said the Lord: “The blood [of the Passover lamb] shall be a sign for you, upon the houses where you are; and when I see the blood, I will pass over you,

and no plague shall fall upon you to destroy you, when I smite the land of Egypt” (Ex. 12:13).

As Ellen G. White put it: “When the first-born in Egypt perished, that of Israel, though graciously preserved, had been justly exposed to the same doom but for the atoning sacrifice.”⁶ This deliverance was, of course, a type of spiritual Israel’s deliverance

BIBLICAL CONCEPTS OF FORGIVENESS

Hebrew. A variety of Hebrew and Greek terms are employed to portray the concept of forgiveness. In Hebrew, the five main words for “forgive” include: (1) *nāśāʾ* to “lift up, take away”—“forgiveness in terms of guilt being taken away, atoned for, or borne, resulting in divine pardon.” (Ex. 28:43; 32:32; Lev. 5:1, 7; Num. 14:19, 34; 18:1; Joshua 24:19; Ps. 85:3; etc.); (2) *sālah* “forgive, pardon” (and derivatives, *sallāh* “ready to forgive,” *slihāh* “forgiveness”), always referring to God’s forgiveness of humanity (Num. 30:5, 8, 12; 1 Kings 8:30, 34, 36, 39, 50; 2 Kings 24:4; Amos 7:2; Ps. 86:5; 130:4; Dan. 9:9; Neh. 12:7, 20; etc.); (3) *māḥab* “wipe away” (Ps. 51:1, 7; Isa. 43:25; 44:22; etc.); (4) *kāsāb* “cover” (Neh. 4:5; Ps. 32:1; 85:2; etc.); and (5) *kippēr* “to atone” (Deut. 21:8; Ps. 78:38; Jer. 18:23; etc.).

Greek. In the LXX, Greek terms expressing forgiveness include the verbs *euilateūō* “show mercy” (used for translating both *nāśāʾ* and *sālah*), and *epikalýptō*, *kalýptō*, and *krýptō* “cover, conceal” (used for *kāsāb*). Sometimes *sālah* is translated as *hileōs*, and *māḥab* is rendered by *exaleipō* “wipe away.”

In the New Testament the concept of forgiveness is portrayed by five verbs: *apolyō* (e.g., Luke 6:37), *aphiēmi* (e.g., Matt. 6:12ff, 1 John 1:9), *charízomai* (2 Cor. 2:7, 10), *kalýptō* (1 Peter 4:8), and *epikalýptō* (Rom. 4:7); and by two nouns: *āphesis* (Mark 3:29; Acts 5:31) “putting away, remission, forgiveness” and *páresis* (Rom. 3:25) “passing over” (The basic lexical information above is largely adapted from R. K. Harrison, “Forgiveness,” *International Standard Bible Encyclopedia* [Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1988], vol. 2, p. 340).

from the bondage of sin. "The sacrificial lamb represents 'the Lamb of God,' in whom is our only hope of salvation."⁷

What is implicit in Passover typology is explicit in the Old Testament sanctuary ritual for forgiveness of sin. In Leviticus 4-6, where specific directions are given for the sin and guilt offerings, the basic pattern is always the same. The sinner brings the sin or guilt offering, lays his hands upon the innocent victim, transferring his sins in figure to the sacrifice; then the animal is slain, and the blood manipulated by the priest to make atonement for the sinner. Eight times this procedure is repeated in these chapters, in connection with various circumstances and parties involved. Each time, after the blood is applied for atonement, the priest proclaims: "He is forgiven."⁸ Forgiveness is based upon the blood of the Substitute that dies in the sinner's place.

Hebrews 9:22 states incisively: "Without the shedding of blood there is no forgiveness [*áphesis*] of sins." Or as Paul writes to the Ephesians: "In him [Jesus] we have redemption through his blood, the forgiveness [*áphesis*] of our trespasses" (1:7).

As we ponder the meaning of the blood in the Passover and the other sacrifices of the sanctuary services, we perceive that the blood was not presented primarily with the purpose of winning over the hearts of sinners. The sinner no doubt was moved by

the ceremony of sacrifice, but in Scripture it was the sinner, already repentant, who presented the sacrifice as a substitute, to typify the Lamb of God who would die in his place.⁹

Ellen G. White describes how "Christ, in counsel with His Father, instituted the system of sacrificial offerings; that death, instead of being immediately visited upon the transgressor, should be transferred to a victim which should prefigure the great and perfect offering of the Son of God."¹⁰

Retributive Justice: A Scriptural Teaching

The concept of substitution as the basis for forgiveness is not just Christ as Substitute from *our* perspective, but from *God's* perspective.¹¹ It involves the biblical truth of retributive justice, which is clearly portrayed throughout Scripture. The law of *lex talionis* (legal, just retribution) is unwaveringly presented in the Torah,¹² Prophets,¹³ and Writings¹⁴ of the Old Testament, in the New Testament Gospels,¹⁵ Epistles,¹⁶ and most clearly, in the Apocalypse.¹⁷ Contrary to the claim of some,¹⁸ *lex talionis* was *not* repudiated on the legal level by Jesus in Matthew 5:38-40. What Christ opposed, in harmony with Old Testament statements, was private vengeance.¹⁹

Ellen G. White emphasizes retributive justice at the cross: "The power that inflicted retributive justice

***“How wrong I was, as a young minister, to conclude
that Ellen White meant I could not have assurance of
forgiveness and acceptance with God!”***

—Davidson

upon man’s substitute and surety, was the power that sustained and upheld the suffering One under the tremendous weight of wrath that would have fallen upon a sinful world. Christ was suffering the death that was pronounced upon the transgressors of God’s law.”²⁰

One cannot contrast (and put in opposition) the way of punishment (which is said to be “primitive” and “pagan”) and the way of forgiveness (which is said to be “God’s way”), as some do.²¹ Rather, in Scripture, forgiveness is possible *because* of the punishment of sin in the person of our Substitute. Ellen G. White boldly states: “Our sins were laid on Christ, punished in Christ, put away by Christ, in order that His righteousness might be imputed to us.”²²

In describing the basis of forgiveness in the blood of Christ, we must be careful to uphold both the mercy and the justice of God. We note, for example, Romans 3:25 and 26 (NKJV): “[Jesus Christ] whom God set forth to be a propitiation by His blood, through faith, to demonstrate His righteousness, because in His forbearance God had passed over the

sins that were previously committed, to demonstrate at the present time His righteousness, that He might be just and the justifier of the one who has faith in Jesus.” Note also Psalm 85:10: “Mercy and truth have met together; righteousness and peace have kissed each other” (NKJV).

Ellen G. White makes it so clear:

“God is approached through Jesus Christ, the Mediator, the only way through which He forgives sins. God cannot forgive sins at the expense of His justice, His holiness, and His truth. But He does forgive sins and that fully. There are no sins He will not forgive in and through the Lord Jesus Christ. This is the sinner’s only hope, and if he rests here in sincere faith, he is sure of pardon and that full and free.”²³

It is not enough to say that on the cross Jesus simply was experiencing the natural consequences of sin to show humanity that the wages of sin is death, and by so doing to win us back to faith.²⁴ It is not enough to see the moral drawing power of the Cross; we must also see Christ’s death as satisfying divine justice. Ellen G. White tells us:

*“Oh, methought, Christ! Christ! there was
nothing but Christ that was before my eyes. . . .
'Twas glorious to me to see his exaltation, and the worth
and prevalency of all his benefits.”*

—Bunyan’s autobiography, p.102.

“Christ on the cross not only draws men to repentance toward God for the transgression of His law—for whom God pardons He first makes penitent—but Christ has satisfied Justice; He has proffered Himself as an atonement. His gushing blood, His broken body, satisfy the claims of the broken law, and thus He bridges the gulf which sin has made.”²⁵

Again: “The sinner receives the forgiveness of his sins, because these sins are borne by his Substitute and Surety. . . . It is the Father’s prerogative to forgive our transgressions and sins, because Christ has taken upon Himself the guilt and reprieved us, imputing to us His own righteousness. His sacrifice satisfies fully the demands of justice.”²⁶ And we cannot omit that potent line in *The Desire of Ages*: “He, the Sin Bearer, endures the wrath of divine justice, and for thy sake becomes sin itself.”²⁷

God could not merely declare humanity forgiven by His free creative power, as some have suggested.²⁸ Both justice and mercy are required,

as part of the very character of God.

As Ellen G. White put it: “Justice demands that sin be not merely pardoned, but the death penalty must be executed. God, in the gift of His only begotten Son, met both these requirements. By dying in man’s stead, Christ exhausted the penalty and provided a pardon.”²⁹

The Nature of Divine Forgiveness

God’s forgiveness is not exactly like human forgiveness. Note what Ellen G. White wrote to Uriah Smith in 1886:

“Men may say, ‘I forgive all the injuries you have done to me,’ but their forgiveness would not blot out one sin. But the Voice sounding from Calvary—‘My son, my daughter, thy sins be forgiven thee’—is all-efficacious. . . . Many have expressed wonder that God demanded so many slain victims in sacrificial offerings of the Jews, but it was to rivet in their minds the great and solemn truth that without shedding of blood there was no remission of sins.”³⁰

Some seem to build their whole structure of forgiveness on the parable of the prodigal son, but R. K. Harrison³¹ has insightfully pointed to the inadequacy of this approach:

“The parable of the Prodigal Son was spoken to teach the freedom of God’s forgiveness and acceptance of returning sinners, and the duty of men to assume the same attitude toward them. This much it teaches, but it fails to set forth entirely God’s attitude toward sin. With reference to the sinner God is love and mercy, but with reference to sin He is righteous, and this element of God’s nature is no less essential to Him than His love, and must be considered in any effort to set forth completely the doctrine of God’s forgiveness of sinners.”

We cannot deny the doctrine of the penal substitution of Christ as some have done³²; we cannot ignore the propitiatory work of Christ on the cross, which satisfies divine retributive justice. This doctrine is at the heart of the sanctuary message; it is clear throughout Old Testament and New Testament theology. It is the consistent view of Ellen White, throughout her life.³³ The atonement also draws people to Christ and leads to healing, as we shall see, but the objective basis for forgiveness must always be Christ’s penal, forensic, substitutionary work.

If one does not acknowledge that forgiveness is based upon the penal substitutionary death of Christ, upon

His satisfying the penalty of divine retributive justice in our place, *then the gospel is distorted at its very core*. In attempting to uphold the gracious character of God, such a view actually emasculates God’s justice and holiness. In fact, it emasculates His mercy as well.

“His [Christ’s] object was to reconcile the prerogatives of justice and mercy, and let each stand separate in its dignity, yet united. His mercy was not weakness, but a terrible power to punish sin because it is sin; yet a power to draw to it the love of humanity. Through Christ Justice is enabled to forgive without sacrificing one jot of its exalted holiness.”³⁴

How Is Substitution Possible?

But some have raised the question, “How is one person able to take the penalty for another’s sins? Is this not confusing the laws of civil and criminal justice?”³⁵ How was it possible for Christ to become our substitute?

The answer is to be found in at least two crucial biblical concepts: (a) Christ is our *Creator*. That means that we are not only His sons and daughters, but also His “workmanship” (Eph. 2:10), His *property*. We *belong* to Him, and thus it is perfectly appropriate for Him to substitute a payment equivalent to (or in reality far exceeding)³⁶ the value of His property.

(b) Christ is the Representative Man, the second Adam. According to Romans 5:10: “While we were ene-

mies we were reconciled to God by the death of his Son.” “The Lord has laid on him the iniquity of us all” (Isa. 53:6). As Ellen G. White put it: “The sins of a guilty world, which in figure are represented as ‘red as crimson,’ were imputed to the divine Surety.”³⁷

Thus Jesus paid an infinite price sufficient to atone for the guilt of the world. Does that mean nothing is left for the sinner to do? In one sense, yes, the whole world has already been reconciled to God. But this leads us to the second facet of forgiveness in Scripture:

II. The Appropriation of Forgiveness

Let’s return in memory to the first Passover. *Patriarchs and Prophets* paints the Passover scene and focuses the issue sharply:

“It was not enough that the paschal lamb be slain; its blood must be sprinkled upon the doorposts; so the merits of Christ’s blood must be applied to the soul. We must believe, not only that He died for the world, but that He died for us individually. *We must appropriate to ourselves the virtue of the atoning sacrifice.*”³⁸

The typology of the sacrifices for sin at the sanctuary presents the same truth. Before the individual sinner received the priestly declaration, “He is forgiven,” he placed his hands upon the head of the innocent animal, and in repentance confessed his sins.³⁹

Some suggest that since Christ died for the sins of the world, thus

reconciling the world to Himself, we are already forgiven; we have only to celebrate our forgiveness. But again, Scripture is clear that before the “corporate forgiveness” worked out on the cross can be individually appropriated, the sinner must see his or her sinfulness in the light of the Cross, be broken in heartfelt repentance and contrition, make confession, and by faith claim the benefits of the atonement personally.

All this process, of course, is the gift of Christ through the operation of the Spirit, and not at all a work generated by sinful humans. Repentance and faith are as much a gift as forgiveness.⁴⁰

“The first step toward salvation is to respond to the drawing of the love of Christ. God sends message after message to men, entreating them to repentance, that He may forgive, and write pardon against their names. Shall there be no repentance? Shall His appeals be unheeded? Shall His overtures of mercy be ignored, and His love utterly rejected? Oh, then man will cut himself off from the medium through which he may gain life eternal; for God. . . pardons [only] the penitent! By the manifestation of His love, by the entreating of His Spirit, He woos men to repentance; for repentance is the gift of God, and whom He pardons He first makes penitent. . . .

“Christ came to reveal to the sinner the justice and love of God, that

“If one does not acknowledge that forgiveness is based upon the penal substitutionary death of Christ, upon His satisfying the penalty of divine retributive justice in our place, then the gospel is distorted at its very core.”

—Davidson

He might give repentance to Israel and remission of sins. When the sinner beholds Jesus lifted upon the cross, suffering the guilt of the transgressor, bearing the penalty of sin; when he beholds God’s abhorrence of evil in the fearful manifestation of the death of the cross, and His love for fallen man, he is led to repentance toward God because of his transgression of the law which is holy, and just, and good. He exercises faith in Christ, because the divine Saviour has become his substitute, his surety, and advocate, the one in whom his very life is centered. To the repenting sinner God can show His mercy and truth, and bestow upon him His forgiveness and love.”⁴¹

In this passage we find the basis of salvation in the substitutionary work of Christ, satisfying divine justice; and we find the path of forgiveness on the part of humanity beautifully condensed. We also see the eagerness with which God longs to forgive human beings:

“Though all heaven has been poured out in one rich gift—for

when God gave His Son, He gave the choicest gift of heaven, and the treasures of heaven are at our command—yet to the repenting soul the enemy will seek to represent God as stern and inexorable, unwilling to pardon the transgressor. At different times letters have come to me from persons who were in despair over their sins. One and another have written: ‘I fear I am past all help. Is there any hope for me?’ To these poor souls the message has been given: ‘Hope in God. The Father has bread enough and to spare. Arise, and go to your Father. He will meet you a great way off. He will give you His love and compassion.’”⁴²

This precious truth leads us to the third facet:

III. The Jubilation of Forgiveness

The apostolic assurance is: “If we confess our sins, he is faithful and just to forgive us our sins, and to cleanse us from all unrighteousness” (1 John 1:9, KJV).

“He [Jesus] lived a sinless life. He died for us, and now He offers to take

our sins and give us His righteousness. If you give yourself to Him, and accept him as your Saviour, then, sinful as your life may have been, for his sake you are accounted righteous. Christ's character stands in place of your character, and you are accepted before God just as if you had not sinned."⁴³

But—

"Here is where thousands fail: they do not believe that Jesus pardons them personally, individually. They do not take God at His word. It is the privilege of all who comply with the conditions to know for themselves that pardon is freely extended for every sin. Put away the suspicion that God's promises are not meant for you. They are for every repentant transgressor."⁴⁴

Ellen White then rehearses the precious promises of God regarding forgiveness—Isaiah 44:22: "I have blotted out, as a thick cloud, thy transgressions, and, as a cloud, thy sins." Ephesians 1:7—"We have redemption through his blood, the forgiveness of sins." "Yes, only believe that God is your helper. . . . As you draw near to Him with confession and repentance, He will draw near to you with mercy and forgiveness."⁴⁵

God wants us to know for sure that we have forgiveness of sins. He wants us to hear the same priestly pronouncement as the Old Testament sinner heard who confessed his sins over the sacrifice: "He is for-

given!" (see Leviticus 4 and 5).

How wrong I was, as a young minister, to read Ellen White's statements refuting the error of "once saved, always saved" and to conclude that she meant I could not have present assurance of forgiveness and acceptance with God! And how right I was, when God led me to understand His beautiful promises of forgiveness, pardon, justification, and acceptance, to step out on His promises by faith. Then it was that I experienced what it meant to be "accepted in the beloved" (Eph. 1:6, KJV).

Since then I have found the divine promises of forgiveness leaping out at me from all over Scripture. And I have found Ellen G. White affirming the joy of forgiveness. Recently I have been looking through the CD ROM recording of all Ellen G. White's published writings.⁴⁶ I was astounded to find her usage of the term *forgiveness* and related words. For *forgive*, 942 entries; for *forgiven*, 740; for *forgiveness*, 953—a total of 2,635 entries relating to forgiveness, not to speak of the word *pardon* employed 1,617 times and *justification/justify/justified*, 1,599 times.

What has especially delighted me was to find so many references to the joy of forgiveness—such phrases as "[David felt] the *rapture* of the assurance of forgiveness"⁴⁷; or "the *sweet evidence* of the forgiveness of their sins."⁴⁸

Have you experienced that rap-

ture, that sweet evidence? It is only a prayer away!

Now we come to

IV. The Attestation of Forgiveness

Or we could call this fourth facet the fruit of forgiveness, namely, a life of obedience and holiness. Again, we find this facet illustrated in the first Passover, where the Lamb prepared whole—not a bone was broken—symbolized the completeness of Christ’s sacrifice. The flesh was to be eaten, indicating that “it is not enough even that we believe on Christ for the forgiveness of sin; we must by faith be constantly receiving spiritual strength and nourishment from Him through His word.”⁴⁹ In her concluding remarks on the Passover service, Ellen G. White observes:

“By obedience the people were to give evidence of their faith. So all who hope to be saved by the merits of the blood of Christ should realize that they themselves have something to do in securing their salvation. While it is Christ only that can redeem us from the penalty of transgression, we are to turn from sin to obedience. Man is to be saved by faith, not by works; yet his faith must be shown by his works. God has given His Son to die as a propitiation for sin, He has manifested the light of truth, the way of life, He has given facilities, ordinances, and privileges; and now man must cooperate with these saving

agencies; he must appreciate and use the helps that God has provided—believe and obey all the divine requirements.”⁵⁰

The emphasis upon the fruit of forgiveness in a forgiving spirit is apparent in Jesus’ discussion in the Sermon on the Mount (Matt. 6:12-15) and again in the parable of the unforgiving servant (Matt. 18:21-35).⁵¹ John presents this balance between root and fruit: “If we confess our sins, he is faithful and just to *forgive* us our sins, and to *cleanse* us from all unrighteousness” (1 John 1:9, KJV).

Forgiveness is not merely a detached legal pronouncement of pardon without any connection to our ethical behavior, as some have claimed. “Forgiveness has a broader meaning than many suppose. . . . God’s forgiveness is not merely a judicial act by which He sets us free from condemnation. It is not only forgiveness *for* sin, but reclaiming *from* sin. It is the outflow of redeeming love that transforms the heart.”⁵²

Together, we have explored four facets of forgiveness. (1) the *foundation* of forgiveness; (2) the *appropriation* of forgiveness; (3) the *jubilation* of forgiveness; and (4) the *attestation* of forgiveness. We have seen that each facet at times has been distorted within Christendom and within Adventism by emphasizing one point to the exclusion of the others. I invite you to renew your dedication to *tota*

Scriptura—to all that Scripture affirms about forgiveness—by grasping the balanced, holistic picture of salvation and forgiveness:

1. Let us embrace the *foundation* of forgiveness in our Substitute, Jesus Christ, who by His propitiatory death satisfied retributive justice in our behalf.

2. Let us reach out by faith in *appropriation* of this wonderful gift of forgiveness, pardon, justification.

3. Let us daily, hourly, know the *jubilation*, the rapture of the assurance of forgiveness.

4. And let us give *attestation* to the reality of our forgiveness by allowing the Saviour not only judicially to pardon our guilt, but also to reclaim us from sin. □

REFERENCES

¹See, for example, *Selected Messages*, book 1, p. 314; *Christ's Object Lessons*, p. 155; and *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* (June 17, 1890), p. 8. For further discussion of the Ellen White statements and my own experience, see "The Good News of Yom Kippur," *Journal of the Adventist Theological Society* 2 (1991): 8, 9.

²See Ellen G. White, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 372.

³John Bunyan, *The Pilgrim's Progress* (London: Fleming H. Revell, Co., 1903), p. 45.

⁴In Psalm 85:2 *forgive* (*nāṣāh*) and *pardon* (*kāṣāh*) are used in parallel: "Thou didst forgive the iniquity of thy people; thou didst pardon all their sin." In Romans 4:6 and 7 (citing Psalm 32:1, 2), Paul virtually equates *forgive* and *justify*. (Bible quotations are from the Revised Standard Version unless otherwise noted.)

⁵Ellen G. White, Ms. 21, 1891, in *The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary* (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publ. Assn. 1977), vol. 6, p. 1070. Italics supplied. Hereafter cited as SDABC.

⁶Ellen G. White, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 274.

⁷*Ibid.*, p. 277.

⁸Lev. 4:20, 26, 31, 35; 5:10, 13, 16; 6:7.

⁹Angel Rodriguez's published dissertation demonstrates the fundamental substitutionary meaning of Passover and the other sanctuary-related sacrifices. See Angel Rodriguez, *Substitution in the Old Testament Cultus*, Andrews University Seminary Doctoral Dissertation Series, vol. 3 (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Andrews University Press, 1982).

¹⁰Ellen G. White, *Signs of the Times* (March 14, 1878), in *Selected Messages*, book 1, p. 230.

¹¹Jack Provonsha, *You Can Go Home Again* (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publ. Assn., 1982), p. 104: "He [Christ] is a substitute, then, from our perspective, not from God's."

¹²E.g., Ex. 21:22-25; Lev. 24:19, 20; Deut. 19:15-21.

¹³E.g., Isa. 3:11; 40:2; Jer. 16:18; 50:15; Eze. 7:27; Obadiah 15.

¹⁴E.g., Ps. 137:8.

¹⁵E.g., Matt. 7:1, 2.

¹⁶E.g., Rom. 2:1, 2; 14:10; 2 Thess. 1:6-9; Col. 3:25; Heb. 2:2, 3.

¹⁷E.g., Rev. 6:9-11; 16:5-7; 18:6-8, 20. Meredith Kline, "Double Trouble," *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 32 (1989): 171-179, has shown that the words translated as "double" in Revelation 18:6; Jeremiah 16:18, Isaiah 40:2, et cetera, actually mean "equivalent."

¹⁸E.g., Provonsha, p. 58: "Jesus Himself repudiated the principle [of *lex talionis*]."

¹⁹Prov. 24:29 and 20:22.

²⁰Ellen G. White, Ms. 35, 1895, in SDABC, vol. 5, p. 1103. Contrast Provonsha, pp. 36, 55-58.

²¹See, e.g., Provonsha, pp. 86, 87.

²²Ellen G. White, *Signs of the Times* (May 30, 1895), in SDABC, vol. 7A, p. 468.

²³SDABC, vol. 7, pp. 912, 913; cf. Ellen G. White, Ms. 29, 1906.

²⁴A. Graham Maxwell, *Can God Be Trusted?* (Nashville, Tenn.: Southern Publ. Assn., 1977), pp. 87, 88.

²⁵Ellen G. White, Ms. 50, 1900, in *Selected Messages*, book 1, p. 34.

²⁶_____, Ms. 21, 1891, in SDABC, vol. 6, p. 1070.

²⁷_____, *The Desire of Ages*, p. 756.

²⁸E.g., Provonsha, pp. 87, 88.

²⁹Ellen G. White, Ms. 50, 1900, in *Selected Messages*, book 1, p. 340. See also *Questions on Doctrine* (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publ. Assn., 1957), pp. 673, 674, for other similar statements.

³⁰Ellen G. White, Letter 85, July 24, 1886, in *The Upward Look*, p. 219.

³¹In his article on "Forgiveness" in the *International Standard Bible Encyclopedia* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1988), vol. 2, p. 343.

³²For a recent denial of penal substitution within Adventism, see Charles Scriven, "God's Justice, Yes; Penal Substitution, No," *Spectrum*, vol. 23, No. 3 (1993): 31-38.

³³See the paper by Jo Ann Davidson on "Atonement and the Writings of Ellen White," forthcoming in *Journal of the Adventist Theological Society*. Ellen White never "matures" to a different view.

³⁴Ellen G. White, *General Conference Bulletin*, 4th Quarter, 1899, vol. 3, p. 102, in SDABC, vol. 7A, p. 470.

³⁵See Provonsha, p. 36.

³⁶White, *The Upward Look*, p. 219: "Justice asked for the sufferings of a man. Christ, equal with God, gave the sufferings of a God. He needed no atonement Himself. It was for man—all for man. . . ."

³⁷Ellen G. White, Ms. 84a, 1897, in SDABC, vol. 7A, p. 462.

³⁸_____, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 277. Italics supplied.

³⁹See Leviticus 4:15, 24, 29, for the reference to laying on of hands; and Lev 5:5 refers to confession; Leviticus 16 and 23 emphasize the aspect of repentance (affliction of soul) in connection with the Day of Atonement; see also Ezekiel 18:30; and especially note 1 Kings 8:47, 50: "If they repent . . . then . . . forgive."

⁴⁰This process is spelled out forcefully in the Penitential Psalms, 32 and 51, and in the chapters in *Steps to Christ* on "Repentance," "Confession," and "Faith and Acceptance."

⁴¹White, *Selected Messages*, book 1, pp. 323, 324.

⁴²*Ibid.*, pp. 324, 325. The 1992 Andrews University Ph.D. dissertation by Gudmundur Olafsson examines a key Old Testament word for forgiveness (*nāšāʾ*), and shows how *nāšāʾ* in the context of forgiveness also implies the supportive relationship, the personal care and loving concern of God, His willingness to take on Himself the consequences of sin, to suffer, even die (See Gudmundur Olafsson, "The Use of *NŠ* in the Pentateuch and Its Contribution to the Concept of Forgiveness," pp. 257-289).

⁴³White, *Steps to Christ*, p. 62.

⁴⁴*Ibid.*, pp. 52, 53.

⁴⁵*Ibid.*, p. 55.

⁴⁶Ellen G. White, *The Published Ellen G. White Writings on Compact Disc* (Silver Spring, Md.: Ellen G. White Estate, Inc., 1992).

⁴⁷SDABC, vol. 3, p. 1146.

⁴⁸Ellen G. White, *Faith and Works*, p. 16. Italics supplied.

⁴⁹_____, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 277.

⁵⁰*Ibid.*, p. 279.

⁵¹Ellen G. White comments: "We are not forgiven *because* we forgive, but *as* we forgive. The ground of all forgiveness is found in the unmerited love of God, but by our attitude toward others we show whether we have made that love our own" (*Christ's Object Lessons*, p. 251). Italics hers.

⁵²_____, *Thoughts From the Mount of Blessing*, p. 114. Italics hers.